

**STATE OF TEXAS
COUNTY OF GILLESPIE
CITY OF FREDERICKSBURG**

**HISTORIC REVIEW BOARD
August 13, 2019
5:30 PM**

On this 13th day of August 2019 the Historic Review Board convened in regular session at the Law Enforcement Center, with the following members present to constitute a quorum:

PRESENT: SHARON JOSEPH
RICHARD LAUGHLIN
LARRY JACKSON
MIKE PENICK
BRAD BERTRAND
ERIC PARKER
BARRY KAISER
JESSICA DAVIS

ABSENT: KAREN OESTREICH
DAVID BULLION

ALSO PRESENT: ANNA HUDSON – Historic Preservation Officer
DANIEL JONES – City Attorney

Sharon Joseph called the meeting to order at 5:30 PM.

MINUTES

Eric Parker discussed an issue with a motion shown in the minutes. Application 19-80 does not state who made the motion. Jessica Davis stated she believed it was David Bullion who made the motion. Eric Parker agreed. Anna Hudson stated the revision would be made.

Motion made by Eric Parker to approve corrected minutes from the August 2019 meeting. Seconded by Larry Jackson . All voted in favor and the motion carried.

STAFF ANNOUNCEMENTS

Anna Hudson provided an update on the Historic District Expansion. Anna stated that a lawsuit had been filed regarding the expansion and a Temporary Restraining Order was issued against this decision, so it was as if this action had not taken place. A hearing will be held on Wednesday, August 14th to discuss the temporary restraining order so she will have more information on that day.

CAMP training will be held in Seguin on Friday, August 16th and is hosted by the Texas Historical Commission. Sharon Joseph, Brad Bertrand and Anna will attend. Anna also provided a link to training regarding Open Meetings Act from the Attorney General’s Office. She reminded the Board this is mandatory and will need to be completed.

PUBLIC COMMENT

No public comments were made

ACTION ITEMS

Election of Chair and Vice Chair

Richard Laughlin made a motion to nominate Sharon Joseph as Chair and Larry Jackson as Vice Chair. Mike Penick seconded the motion. All voted in favor and the motion carried.

CONSENT AGENDA

Application #19-95 - 110 S. Acorn – Roy Gentry – New Structure

Application #19-96 - 408 N. Llano – Wheeler Custom Homes – New Structure

Application #19-99 - 207 S. Adams – Fusion Master Builders – New STR Unit

Eric Parker and Brad Bertrand recused themselves from the Consent Agenda and left the table.

Motion to approved the Consent Agenda made by Mike Penick. Richard Laughlin seconded the motion. All others voted in favor and the motion carried.

Application #19-97 – 110 E. Orchard – Todd Stephens – Demolition and New Construction

Anna Hudson, Historic Preservation Officer, stated the applicant is requesting approval for demolition of 1950s garage and 1980s carport as well as conceptual approval of the following: New construction “the Azalea” 28’x 31’ is a one car garage with a small cottage studio upstairs with a covered loggia
“Studio Tower” 20’x 20’ is a cabin with a garage on the lower level and living unit on second floor.

Roof - dark gray composite.

“the Elm” structure will be phase 2 that they do not want to start for 1-2 years after the completion of the Azalea and the Studio Tower.

Staff Recommendation:

The proposed new construction will require the removal of the 1950s metal garage and 1980s carport. The garage was given a rating of medium given its age and integrity. The garage should be retained on site, or otherwise re-used in the design of the new structures. The carport is low rated and does not contribute to the district.

The size and scale of the new structures are appropriate for the lot. The designs are modern interpretations and do not try to mimic local styles. The studio tower shingle siding is not a common siding.

The Elm structure will be the largest and will have the greatest impact on the district. More information is needed on the setback along Cora Street and how it will impact the property to the north.

Staff recommends conceptual approval.

Todd Stephens presented the application. A summary of the project is to maintain the windmill and tank and use them as part of the concept. The new structures will be the Azalea and the Tower Studio which will be part of phase one. The Tower Studio will have hardy plank concrete shingles and will mimic the style of the tank. Phase two would be the Elm, this will be completed 1 -2 years later.

The carport is low rated and is in pretty bad shape. The garage has R22 metal siding with a wood frame that is rotted. The owners would like to salvage this material and use it as part of the Azalea project.

Todd Stephens wanted to clarify that at this point he is only requesting conceptual approval as he is not ready to provide additional details such as colors.

Sharon Joseph stated that the new construction is conceptual however his request for demolition is not so she will break the application down into two parts.

Larry Jackson asked if there were pictures of the garage. Anna stated she did not have detailed photos of the garage.

Eric Parker asked if the ordinance allowed for demolition of a Medium Rated structure. Anna stated the ordinance states the building may be relocated. City Attorney, Daniel Jones, stated the ordinance prohibits demolition unless qualification for a hardship is met.

Eric Parker stated the options are to relocate the building on the property or change the rating to low. Daniel Jones stated the Board could also find a hardship exception as a third option.

Sharon Joseph asked if the Board could change the building to a Low rating without an application that states that as a request. Daniel Jones stated the application is not noticed that way, typically, this application would be brought back before the Board at a later date with that request.

Sharon Joseph stated that the Board would only be able to take action on the request for demolition regarding the carport.

Todd Stephens stated the owners told him the medium rated structure could be repurposed on the property and as for the integrity of the garage building, he would park a car in it as the frame is infested with termites.

Richard Laughlin asked Daniel Jones if 3 habitable buildings could be built in an R2 Zoned property. Daniel Jones stated that is a question better directed towards Anna Hudson. Anna stated yes you could have up to 8 units but he would have to work with the density.

Sharon Jones requested a motion on the carport.

Eric Parker made a motion to approve the carport for demolition. Larry Jackson seconded the motion. All voted in favor and the motion carried.

Eric Parker recommended taking no action on the demolition request regarding the garage. He would like

to encourage Todd Stephens to return with proof that the garage is hazardous to qualify for a hardship with a Medium Rating resource or an application requesting the resource receives a Low Rating.

Eric Parker made a motion to take no action on the demolition for the 1950's garage and postpone this request to the September 10th meeting allowing the applicant to provide additional documentation. Jessica Davis seconded the motion. All voted in favor and the motion passed.

Todd Stephens asked for feedback regarding incorporating the garage into the Studio Tower Building. Richard Laughlin stated the Board always supports preserving a resource and utilizing it in the project.

Sharon Joseph stated she would like to discuss the Conceptual approval for the project.

Mike Penick pointed out that there are several discrepancies regarding dimensions. Todd Stephen stated the dimensions listed are inaccurate numbers provided by ownership and his numbers regarding the site. He has not finalized all of this information, again he is only requesting conceptual approval.

Brad Bertrand stated that none of the materials presented in the application have been specifically chosen for this project. He wanted to clarify that this is all for conceptual approval. Todd Stephens stated that is correct.

Eric Parker made a motion to Conceptually Approve Application 19-97. Richard Laughlin seconded the motion. All voted in favor and the motion passed.

Application # 19-94 – 511 W. Main – Jeff Brickner – Replacement Windows

The applicant, Jeff Brickner, was not present.

Daniel Jones, City Attorney, stated if the applicant is not present the Ordinance deems the application as incomplete. The application may then be placed on the next agenda. If the applicant does not attend that meeting the application may then be withdrawn.

This application will be placed on the September 10th Agenda.

Application # 19-56 – 418 W. Austin – Robert Zamora – New STR Units

Anna Hudson, Historic Preservation Officer, stated the applicant is requesting approval of construction of 5 (five) new 2-story (25'4") faux fachwerk STRs and 1 one-story faux fachwerk STR with standing seam metal roofs. Exterior to have 3-coat troweled finished stucco and painted rough sawn wood fachwerk/trim (colors proposed include blue, red, and brown). Windows to be single hung, divided lite. Doors to be solid core hardwood with divided lite top panels and new cedar fencing.

Staff recommendation:

At the June HRB meeting conceptual approval was given conditioned upon simplified "toned down"

fachwerk style and bringing down plate heights

The historic (RTHL) main house is 20'6". The new units are 25'4". The proposed new construction is at the rear of the property, however will be visible given the height and density. The main house is two-story, but the density proposed dramatically changes the site and neighborhood development pattern. The proposed design has not been modified since conceptual approval and does not meet the conditions made by the board.

Staff recommends the design be changed to not mimic historic architectural styles of Germany and be more reflective of the Hill Country. Historically fachwerk in Fredericksburg was small scale, not two stories and did not have painted wooden members. The design is an inaccurate interpretation of fachwerk and distorts the perception of genuine historic buildings.

The proposed cedar stave fencing is more appropriate for the site and district.

This recommendation is in keeping with the SOI Standards and Fredericksburg Design Guidelines for new construction as cited above.

Sharon Joseph read a letter provided from a neighbor, Andrea Kanuma, who resides at 207 N. Edison. The letter expressed her opposition to this project and specifically stated that the new design construction is not compatible with the neighborhood.

Sharon Joseph asked the presenter, Kevin Vinall, if he has addressed the Board's previous comments regarding this application. She stated the Board has seen this application previously and she wanted to ensure that he was presenting an application that depicted adjustments based on the Board's comments.

Kevin Vinall presented the application. Brad Bertrand commented that the Board's previous comments were regarding the style and the request for more contemporary style and not a false representation of a historic property. He is not seeing those comments represented in the application before him.

Kevin Vinall requested feedback regarding the design. He stated conceptual approval was given to this project and now he is not sure how to proceed. Anna Hudson stated conceptual approval was given, however, several stipulations were provided and none of them have been met.

Brad Bertrand stated he is not a fan of the fachwerk. He stated he would like to see a more contemporary approach to this project and is not interested in the false representation that is currently being presented. Eric Parker agreed with Brad's comments. Eric said when he has seen faux work in Fredericksburg, it has always been with untreated wood and never painted bright colors.

Kevin Vinall stated it is his feeling that the Board is opposed to the fachwerk architectural style. Anna Hudson commented that she was in the DRC meeting with Robert Zamora and Kevin Vinall 6 months previously when she advised them that this design needed to be dramatically toned down.

Kevin Vinall went on to ask questions regarding the design and Mike Penick stated that the Board is not able to design the project for the applicant. Mike stated good feedback had been provided regarding the building height and style. The applicant needed to make the modifications and return to the Board.

Sharon Joseph asked Kevin Vinall if he would be in agreement to move this application to the

September 10th meeting. Kevin stated he was in agreement.

Larry Jackson made a motion to take no action on Application 19-56 and postpone to the September 10th meeting. Eric Parker seconded the motion. All voted in favor and the motion carried.

Application #19-57B – 420 W. Austin – Robert Zamora – New STR Units

Anna Hudson, Historic Preservation Officer, stated the applicant is requesting approval of 3 new STR units of faux fachwerk design located between the Ellebracht-Sagebiel House at 420 and Vogel Sunday house at 418 W Austin. The 18' structures will have standing seam metal roofs. Exterior to have 3-coat troweled finished stucco and painted rough sawn wood fachwerk/trim (green). Windows to be single hung, divided lite. Doors to be solid core hardwood with divided lite top panels.

A two-story (25'6") STR at the rear of the property next to existing tank house with 3 coat troweled finished stucco and painted rough sawn wood fachwerk/trim (green trim color). Windows to be single hung, divided lite. Doors to be solid core hardwood with divided lite top panels and new cedar stave fencing.

Staff recommendation:

At the June HRB meeting a motion was made for approval of conceptual plan for three single story units and one 2-story structure with an 8 ft fence with cedar pickets or coyote fence with a flatter roof line on the 3-unit building and less embellishment on the 2-story structure.

The 3-unit structure competes with the 2 historic houses in both size and design. The rooflines have not been reduced since conceptual approval. The faux fachwerk is not appropriate. Staff does not recommend approval as submitted.

The stand-alone STR at the rear of the property is acceptable in size and massing. The style is simplified. The other units should follow the design of this structure.

The fencing has been changed to a more traditional material and is found throughout the district. These recommendations are based on the SOI Standards and FBG Design Guidelines cited above.

Kevin Vinall stated he feels everything regarding this application has already been discussed.

Richard Laughlin agreed and went on to say he feels Kevin should differentiate between 418 & 420 W. Austin. Mike Penick wanted to encourage Kevin to come up with a design that is more compatible.

Eric Parker made a motion to take no action on Application 19-57-B and postpone to the September 10th meeting. Mike Penick seconded the motion. All voted in favor and the motion carried.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Preservation Grant Funds

Anna Hudson commented that the Board has \$10,000 in the budget for this grant and encouraged the Board to let potential applicants know of its availability. Jessica Davis asked if the City can use social media to help spread the word. Anna said she would work with the Public Information Officer to promote the grant application on social media.

Design Guidelines

An RFQ is currently out and the response is due on Thursday, August 15th. A Committee of 3 Board Members, Kent Myers and Brian Jordan will meet to narrow the responses down and hopefully make a selection.

Update on Landmark Designation Process of 1922 School Building

FISD trustees voted to approve the landmark Designation with a 5 ft buffer. This will be on the September agenda.

ADJOURN

With nothing further to come before the Board, Larry Jackson moved to adjourn. Jessica Davis seconded the motion All voted in favor and the meeting was adjourned at 6:51 p.m.

PASSED AND APPROVED this the 10th day of September 2019.

SHELBY COLLIER, COORDINATOR

SHARON JOSEPH, CHAIR